DRAFT MINUTES OF 8/12-13/08 ICOC MEETING

Location:
Stanford University
Arrillaga Alumni Center
326 Galvez Street
Stanford, CA 94305

Ricardo Azziz **Alternate Donald Dafoe**	Present
Robert Birgeneau **Alternate Robert Price**	Present
Floyd Bloom	Present
David Brenner	Present
Susan V. Bryant **Alternate Jacob Levin**	Present
Marsha Chandler	Absent
Marcy Feit	Absent
Michael A. Friedman	Present
Leeza Gibbons	Absent
Michael Goldberg	Present
Sam Hawgood **Alternate Nancy Milliken**	Present
Robert Klein	Present
Sherry Lansing	Present
Gerald S. Levey	Absent
Ted W. Love	Present
Tina Nova	Absent
Ed Penhoet	Present
Philip A. Pizzo	Present
Claire Pomeroy **Alternate Ann Bonham**	Present
Francisco J. Prieto	Absent
Robert Quint	Present
John C. Reed	Absent
Duane Roth	Present
Joan Samuelson	Present
David Serrano Sewell	Present
Jeff Sheehy	Present
Jonathan Shestack	Absent
Oswald Steward	Present

Agenda Item # 4: Approval of minutes from June 26-27, 2008 ICOC meetings.

Motion:

- Ms. Lansing moved for approval of the minutes from June 26-27, 2008.
- Dr. Brenner seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion, approving the minutes as final.

To view the final minutes, as approved and posted on the CIRM web site, see this URL: http://www.cirm.ca.gov/cirm/node/851

Agenda Item # 5: Chairman's Report.

Chairman Klein gave a report including:

- A special note on the heroic efforts of David Ames, a local attorney suffering from ALS for the past several years. The disease had recently claimed his life.
- Milestones in research and facilities grants.
- Collaboration with the state legislature.

Agenda Item # 6: President's Report

To view Dr. Trounson's slides for his report, see this URL: http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/081208_item_6.pdf

Agenda Item # 7: Consideration of appointment of new scientific members for Grants Working Group.

Motion:

- Mr. Roth moved for approval of the proposed new scientific members for the Grants Working Group.
- Dr. Levin seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion, approving new scientific members for the Grants Working Group.

To view the details on the approved new members, see this URL: http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/081208_item_7.pdf

Agenda Item # 8: Consideration of appointment of new member to Standards Working Group.

Motion:

- Ms. Lansing moved for approval of the new member to the Standards Working Group.
- Dr. Friedman seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion, approving the new member for the Standards Working Group.

To view the background information on the new member of the Standards Working Group, see this URL: http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/081208_item_8.pdf

Agenda Item # 9: Consideration of update from Standards Working Group and a regulatory amendment authorizing a procedure for petitioning the ICOC to designate stem cell lines derived before November 2006 as acceptably derived for use in CIRM-funded research.

To view the background document for this item, see this URL:
http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/081208_item_9.pdf

Motion:

- Dr. Love moved for approval of the proposed grandfathering provision as an interim regulation, which would be in existence for 270 days and permit us to undergo the formal Administrative Procedure Act process.
- Dr. Price seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion.

To view the background document for this specific vote, see this URL:
http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/081208_item_9a.pdf

Motion:

- Dr. Price moved for approval of the proposed regulatory language regarding grandfathering IVF-derived embryos derived before August 12, 2008.
- Dr. Quint seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion.

To view the language for the proposed and approved regulatory amendment, please see these 3 URLs:

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/081208_item_9.pdf

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/081208_item_9a.pdf

http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/081208_item_9b.pdf

Agenda Item # 10: Consideration of definition for "California Supplier."

To view the background memo on this item, please see this URL:
http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/081208_item_10a.pdf

Motion:

- Mr. Roth moved for approval of the proposed definition for California Supplier, as developed by a subcommittee of 2 ICOC members in conjunction with CIRM staff and communication with the public. The motion included approval for staff to initiate the Administrative Procedure Act process.
- Dr. Pizzo seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion.

To view the definition as approved, please see this URL:
http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/081208_item_10.pdf

Agenda Item # 11: Consideration of recommendations from Grants Working Group on New Faculty Awards II Applications.

Agenda item # 12 & 13: CLOSED SESSION & REPORT BACK

a. Discussion of confidential intellectual property or work product and prepublication, confidential scientific research or data relating to New Faculty Awards II applications. (Health & Safety Code 125290.30(d) (3) (B) and (C)).

b. Discussion of Personnel (Government Code section 11126, subdivision (a); Health & Safety Code section 125290.30(d) (3) (D)).

Motion:

- Mr. Klein moved for approval for funding all of the grant applications in Tier 1, if not modified by additional votes on Tiers 2 and 3 later in the meeting (the next day).
- Dr. Love seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by roll call vote, approved this motion, approving the applications in Tier 1 for funding.

Motion:

- Ms. Samuelson moved for approval for funding/movement into Tier 1 of grant applications 905, 952 and 902.
- Mr. Roth seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by roll call vote, approved this motion, approving applications 905, 952 and 902 for funding.

Motion:

- Mr. Roth moved for approval for funding/movement into Tier 1 of grant applications 936, 914 and 943.
- Ms. Samuelson seconded the motion.

Vote:

- A roll call vote was taken and this motion failed.

Agenda Item # 14: Consideration of CIRM Loan Policy.

Duane Roth presented the policy as developed by the Loan Task Force and staff members in the Office of the Chair, in public meetings throughout the previous several months. There was a sense of the ICOC that the ICOC is supportive of the policy as developed, though the body should consider and vote on the policy at its next meeting in September 2008. Following actual approval of the policy by the ICOC, CIRM's administrative staff should now move forward with implementing the loan program.

Agenda Item # 15: Consideration of names for CIRM funded Major Facilities.

This item was presented, and there was a strong sense of the ICOC in support for the two proposed names. The ICOC thereby gave staff the authority to inform the grant recipients they could move forward with the use of these names.

Agenda Item #16: Consideration of recommendations on RFA applicant policies.

Motion:

- Dr. Penhoet moved for approval of the recommendations of the ICOC task force on RFA applicant policies.
- Dr. Friedman seconded the motion.

Vote:

- The ICOC, by voice vote, approved this motion, approving recommendations on RFA applicant polices as developed by the ICOC task force formed for this purpose.

To view the recommendations as approved, see this URL:
http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/081208_item_16.pdf

Agenda Item # 17: Consideration of Policy Regarding Extraordinary Petitions for ICOC Consideration of Applications for Funding.

The ICOC discussed the proposed policy and agreed to have staff take the ICOC comments into consideration in updated the proposed policy, and present it to the ICOC for further consideration at its next meeting, scheduled to take place September 25, 2008.

Agenda Item # 18: Consideration of update from Legislative Subcommittee.

To view the documents related to this updated, please see this URL and click through the linked items listed under agenda item # 18.:
http://www.cirm.ca.gov/cirm/node/724

Agenda Item # 19: Consideration of annual report on CIRM contracts and interagency agreements.

This item was prepared for the ICOC as an update report, as is presented annually to the ICOC. Interim reports are made to the Governance Subcommittee at each meeting of that Subcommittee.
To view the report prepared for the ICOC, see this URL:
http://www.cirm.ca.gov/meetings/pdf/2008/081208_item_19.pdf

Agenda Item # 20: Consideration of update on gifts to CIRM.

This item was not covered at this meeting. A report on this topic was presented to the ICOC at its meeting on June 26-27, 2008, and there were no further updates as of August 12-13, 2008.

VOTE TALLIES

New Faculty II
8-12-13-08

CALIFORNIA INSTITUTE FOR REGENERATIVE MEDICINE

RN2-00902-1 ..... Dafoe, Lansing, Levey
RN2-00903-1 ..... Hawgood, Sheehy
RN2-00904-1 ..... Dafoe, Lansing, Levey
RN2-00906-1 ..... Feit, Hawgood, Lansing, Sheehy
RN2-00907-1 ..... Goldberg, Pizzo
RN2-00908-1 ..... Bloom, Brenner, Lansing, Reed
RN2-00909-1 ..... Goldberg, Pizzo
RN2-00910-1 ..... Bloom, Brenner, Goldberg, Lansing, Pizzo, Reed
RN2-00912-1 ..... Bryant, Lansing, Steward
RN2-00913-1 ..... Bryant, Lansing, Steward
RN2-00914-1 ..... Bloom, Price
RN2-00915-1 ..... Bryant, Lansing, Steward
RN2-00917-1 ..... Lansing
RN2-00918-1 ..... Feit, Lansing, Pomeroy, Prieto
RN2-00919-1 ..... Feit, Hawgood, Lansing, Sheehy
RN2-00920-1 ..... Dafoe, Lansing, Levey
RN2-00921-1 ..... Bryant, Feit, Lansing, Pomeroy, Prieto
RN2-00922-1 ..... Feit, Lansing, Pomeroy, Prieto
RN2-00923-1 ..... Lansing, Penhoet, Price
RN2-00924-1 ..... Bryant, Lansing, Steward
RN2-00925-1 ..... Bloom, Dafoe, Lansing, Levey, Reed
RN2-00927-1 ..... Dafoe, Lansing, Levey
RN2-00929-1 ..... Feit, Hawgood, Lansing, Sheehy
RN2-00930-1 ..... Dafoe
RN2-00931-1 ..... Bloom, Brenner, Lansing, Reed
RN2-00932-1 ..... Feit, Lansing, Pomeroy, Prieto
RN2-00933-1 ..... Feit, Hawgood, Lansing, Sheehy
RN2-00934-1 ..... Feit, Hawgood, Lansing, Sheehy
RN2-00935-1 ..... Bloom, Brenner, Dafoe, Lansing, Levey, Reed
RN2-00936-1 ..... Bloom, Reed
RN2-00937-1 ..... Friedman
RN2-00939-1 ..... Bloom
RN2-00942-1 ..... Dafoe, Lansing, Levey
RN2-00943-1 ..... Bloom
RN2-00944-1 ..... Bryant, Lansing, Steward
RN2-00945-1 ..... Bloom, Brenner, Lansing, Reed
RN2-00947-1 ..... Bloom, Brenner, Lansing, Reed
RN2-00948-1 ..... Feit, Hawgood, Lansing, Pomeroy, Prieto, Sheehy
RN2-00949-1 ..... Feit, Hawgood, Lansing, Pomeroy, Prieto, Sheehy
RN2-00950-1 ..... Feit, Hawgood, Lansing, Sheehy
RN2-00952-1 ..... Hawgood, Sheehy
RN2-00953-1 ..... Dafoe

August 12-13, 2008

MOTION	To approve new Faculty II Applications in Tier 1, unless the Board modifies the approval on 8-13-2008
Motion Maker	Klein
Seconded	Love

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Donald Dafoe	1		Except	
Robert Price	1		Except	
Floyd Bloom	1		Except	
David Brenner	1		Except	
Jacob Levin	1		Except	
Michael Friedman	1		Except	
Michael Goldberg	1		Except	
Bob Klein	1			
Sherry Lansing	1		Except	
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet	1		Except	
Phil Pizzo	1		Except	
Claire Pomeroy	1		Except	
Robert Quint	1			
Duane Roth	1			
Joan Samuelson	1			
David Serrano-Sewell	1			
Jeff Sheehy	1		Except	
Oswald Steward	1		Except	
TOTAL	**19**	**0**		

August 12-13, 2008

MOTION	To fund new Faculty II Applications RN2-00905-1, RN2-00952-1, RN2-00902-1, unless the Board modifies its prior approval of Tier 1
Motion Maker	Samuelson
Seconded	Roth

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Donald Dafoe	1		Except	
Robert Price		1		
Floyd Bloom	1			
David Brenner	1		Except	
Jacob Levin		1		
Michael Friedman		1		
Michael Goldberg	1			
Nancy Milliken		1	Except	
Bob Klein	1			
Sherry Lansing		1	Except	
Ted Love	1			
Ed Penhoet	1			
Phil Pizzo	1			
Claire Pomeroy		1		
Robert Quint	1			
Duane Roth	1			
Joan Samuelson	1			
Jeff Sheehy	1		Except	
Oswald Steward		1		
TOTAL	**12**	**7**		

August 12-13, 2008

MOTION	To fund new Faculty II applications RN2-00936-1, RN2-00914-1, RN2-00943-1 for three years with two year extension based on staff determination
Motion Maker	Roth
Seconded	Samuelson

MEMBER	YES	NO	CONFLICT	ABSTAIN
Donald Dafoe		1		
Robert Price			1	
Floyd Bloom			1	
David Brenner		1		
Jacob Levin		1		
Michael Friedman		1		
Michael Goldberg		1		
Nancy Milliken		1		
Bob Klein	1			
Sherry Lansing		1		
Ted Love		1		
Ed Penhoet		1		
Phil Pizzo		1		
Claire Pomeroy	1			
Robert Quint		1		
Duane Roth	1			
Joan Samuelson	1			
Jeff Sheehy	1			
Oswald Steward		1		
TOTAL	**5**	**12**	**2**	**0**